

Knowledge Management in CACILM Phase II – Project review and planning meeting

3-4 October 2013, Tashkent, Uzbekistan

Meeting minutes

The International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) has provided a grant to International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas (ICARDA) to carry out a three-year regional project as part of the second phase of Central Asian Countries Initiative for Land Management (CACILM). This new project will develop knowledge platform to consolidate knowledge and to upscale sustainable land management (SLM) interventions. Inception workshop was held in Bishkek on 10-12 June 2013, materials of the workshop are available at <http://www.cac-program.org/cacilm.asp>. The purpose of the project review and planning meeting was to revisit and discuss in detail the work plans developed, in order to foster the project implementation by assigning clear actions and responsibility among partners.

Country focal points and component leaders from participating countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan) as well as from ICARDA headquarters and regional office for CAC were invited. Nominations were received from all countries except from Turkmenistan, and 22 participants took part in the meeting, 12 of them coming from national partner organizations. The national partners were nominated through Ministries of Agriculture and their national research organizations in each country. The draft Memorandum of Agreement (MoA) was circulated to the focal points representing the countries for comments. This document provides a brief report of the meeting.

Welcoming session and recap

The event was opened by Dr. Jozef Turok, Head of CGIAR PFU and Regional Coordinator of ICARDA-CAC. Introductory round introduced participants from each represented country and from ICARDA, and also recently appointed project coordinator, Dr. Akmal Akramkhanov, was introduced. This round was followed by presentation session starting with Dr. Feras Ziadat presenting project goals and the summary of inception workshop to update participants.

First year plans for each component were presented by the three component leaders Drs. Feras Ziadat, Michael Devlin, and Aden Aw-Hassan. After presentation round, represented countries confirmed or nominated responsible persons for each component (Table 1). The rest of sessions were devoted to discussions and agreements for each component activities including break-out groups and plenary.

Table 1 Names of responsible persons for each component nominated by countries

Country	Focal Point	Component 1 – Knowledge Synthesis and Generation	Component 2 – Knowledge Packaging and	Component 3 – Using Knowledge in Policy
---------	-------------	--	---------------------------------------	---

			Dissemination	Dialogue
Kazakhstan	Abdulla Saparov	Tokseyitova Gulnar	Dossymbek Sydyk	Otarov Azimbai
Kyrgyzstan	Nurlan Dyusheev	Elemanova Gulmira* Malik Bekenov	Atakanov Amanjon* Martynova Lyudmila	Ismailov Sharshanbek
Tajikistan	Hukmatullo Ahmadov	Narzulloev Tosh	Davlatjon Komilzade	Ergasheva Tanzila
Turkmenistan	Gurbanmyrat Mezilov	Expected	Expected	Expected
Uzbekistan	Ramazan Kuziev	Toshquziev Ma'rif	Abdurakhmanov Nodir	Bokhodirov Zafar

*responsible person

There were suggestions to take into account during implementation and few clarifying and thought provoking questions to stimulate initial discussions:

- Project implementation should involve students as much as possible, project is for 3 years which gives sufficient time to involve master level or PhD students to conduct studies and to help them to develop thesis work;
- Promising way of presentation and dissemination of knowledge is feasible via “share-fair” concept, where different level stakeholders can be involved and targeted;
- Downscaling climate change scenarios to the region and country levels were indicated as necessary during the inception workshop and to conduct training, this will be pursued as a separate activity;
- Adaptation strategies for SLM, for 4 agro-ecosystems selected during inception workshop – irrigated, rainfed, rangelands, and mountains. Template for synthesis report of SLM concerning all selected agro-ecosystems needs to be developed jointly, so that this info can be fed into ‘information platform’, need to consult database specialist in developing this template;
- Format used for WOCAT is potentially suitable to adapt and simplify for this project.

What needs to change: farming system or practices? – and what is the ultimate goal or what will be achieved or expected from this project were discussed at length. Another stimulating discussion was around how far one should go with advocating required policy changes, where or how high we want to go? Comments regarding the goal of the project were received from participants. These included, that it will improve knowledge, present choice of technologies to stakeholders, need for joint efforts from countries, because problems are similar and ways to solve can be used among countries. If project objectives are achieved, this will provide a solid knowledge platform to refer for decision making, credible interventions for SLM that are tested, and also can lead to diversification options for production.

During the second half of the 1st day participants convened for a group work divided by component themes to discuss details, reach agreements, and clarifications regarding activities under each component. Each group presented the outcome of the working groups in a plenary session to share with other components and to synchronize events of each component.

Component 1

Feras Ziadat (ICARDA), Gulnar Tokseyitova (KZ), Gulmira Elemanova (KG), Tosh Narzulloev (TJ), Tashkuziev Maruf (UZ), Tulkun Yuldashev (ICARDA), Akmal Akramkhanov (ICARDA) – discussions and agreements

Contact details of responsible persons for Component 1:

#	Full Name	Country	Organization	Position
1	Ms. Tokseyitova Gulnara Asanovna	Kazakhstan	Research Institute of Soil Science	Head of department of scientific information support
2	Ms. Elemanova Gulmira Akmagalievna	Kyrgyzstan	Ministry of Agriculture and Melioration	Chief Specialist
3	Dr. Narzulloev Tosh Sadullaevich	Tajikistan	Research Institute of Farming	Deputy Director for Research
4	Dr. Toshquziev Ma'ruf Mansurovich	Uzbekistan	State Research Institute of Soil Science and Agrochemistry	Head of department "Soil chemistry, physics-chemistry and soil minerology"

Group discussion concerning carrying out of activities was facilitated by Dr. Feras Ziadat. The following are the major points discussed and agreed:

- Activity 1.1.1: For collection and synthesis of SLM technologies – progressive reporting is thought to be more appropriate, component leaders will send what is collected every month. However, by the end of December 2013, a comprehensive list of all potential SLM should be completed for each country. It was highlighted that not only SLM developed under CACILM-I but all SLM (socio-economic, Bright Spots practices etc.) which will benefit to livelihoods of people in the region should be considered.
- Activity 1.1.2: Subsequent appraisal and selection of suitable SLM for packaging and dissemination is better done through a workshop organized to develop criteria for technologies selection. This workshop will also develop criteria for similarity analysis for each selected SLM that will be used to generate similarity maps for particular SLM.
- Activity 1.1.3: To document in more detail the selected SLM, suggestion was to develop a light WOCAT questionnaire as a standard template for the five countries.
- Activity 1.1.4: Main gaps on knowledge were preliminary identified during the inception and were discussed and confirmed in this meeting, these are: downscaling of climate change scenarios and selection and testing of SLM to facilitate the adaptation to climate change under the four agro-ecosystems.
- Activity 1.2.1: Climate change impact on land management will be assisted by Debra Turner, Mariya Glazirina and Tulkun Yuldashev, and there will be need to involve consultant to downscale climate change scenarios (from global to regional or country scale) and conduct training for NARS.
- Activity 1.2.2: For field activities there is need to conduct field days for farmers and in collaboration with extension services and Component 2, to properly document and evaluate the benefit of demonstration activities and to provide the information in a suitable format.
- Activity 1.2.3: Gender sensitive technologies, possibly include diversification options that are suitable for particular community such as dairy products, honey bee keeping, herbal plants, mushroom production and handcrafts. This is to ensure the active and productive involvement of women. The ideal option will include the alternative(s) that also facilitate adaptation to climate change and encourage the participation of women.
- Activity 1.3.1: To organize a workshop to develop similarity criteria for each selected SLM of the four agro-ecosystems (please see activity 1.1.2). Similarity maps take into account set of criteria (i.e. soil depth, target zone, suitability for dissemination etc.) and will be created for potential out scaling of best technologies for identified zones with similar conditions.

Component 2

Michael Devlin (ICARDA), Dossymbek Sydyk (KZ), Davlatjon Komilzade (TJ), Ramazan Kuzyev (UZ), Abdurakhmanov Nodir (UZ), Botir Dosov (ICARDA), Mutalib Begmuratov (ICARDA)

Contact details of responsible persons for Component 2:

#	Full Name	Country	Organization	Position
1	Prof. Sydyk Dossymbek Almakhanovich	Kazakhstan	South-Western research institute of livestock and plant science	Head of unit
2	Mr. Atakanov Amanjon	Kyrgyzstan	Kyrgyz Research Institute of Irrigation	Deputy director
3	Dr. Komilzade Davlatjon	Tajikistan	Academy of agricultural sciences	Chief scientific secretary
4	Dr. Abdurakhmanov Nodir	Uzbekistan	State Research Institute of Soil Science and Agrochemistry	Specialist

Group discussion concerning carrying out of activities listed in Appendix C was facilitated by Dr. Michael Devlin. The following are the major points discussed and agreed:

- One of the key tasks to establish effective communication plan was to define key users for CACILM information;
- Website and database creation will be part of building information platform. Currently, as a resource for website, number of documents are likely already available and accessible, there is need to create library of compiled documents with English summary;
 - Developed website could also publish work in progress – activities to be expected and other works from the country;
 - Collect historical information, laws and regulations by countries regarding innovation promotion/introduction to currently fill the website without waiting for results of Component 1;
- There is need to establish framework for innovation extension, as extension service is the weakest point in the region;
- Before introducing SLM technologies in the region it will be necessary to involve extension agencies (for example in KG) to select technologies that are needed by farmers, as extension agencies are close to farmers;
- There are number of events planned in different components, there is need to synchronize events of each component and among them, seminars, workshops, field days etc. Events where possible should be aggregated and target those related to selected 4 agro-ecological zones;
- Publication types foreseen during the project will include the following:
 - Technical reports;
 - Policy reports, translation of the documents to the local languages;
 - Booklets, fliers, and poster;
- Discuss and develop “share fair” approach as platform for exchanging information and learning together.

Component 3

Aden Aw-Hassan (ICARDA), Abdulla Saparov (KZ), Azimbai Otarov (KZ), Malik Bekenov (KG), Bakhodirov Zafar (UZ), Aziz Nurbekov (ICARDA), Nariman Nishanov (ICARDA)

Contact details of responsible persons for Component 3:

#	Full Name	Country	Organization	Position
1	Dr. Otarov Azimbai	Kazakhstan	Research Institute of Soil Science	Head of unit melioration of saline soils
2	Dr. Batyrkanov	Kyrgyzstan	Agrar University	Dean of faculty
3	Ms. Ergasheva Tanzila	Tajikistan	Institute of Economy	Specialist
4	Mr. Bokhodirov Zafar	Uzbekistan	State Research Institute of Soil Science and Agrochemistry	Specialist

Group discussion concerning carrying out of activities listed in Appendix C was facilitated by Dr. Aden Aw-Hassan. The following are the major points discussed and agreed:

- Each country should appoint an economist for Component 3 by the end of October 2013;
- Revise organization structure and strategic plan of SLM policy. Develop a picture of the policy in the region;
- Review land registration status in the respective project countries;
- Train the national SLM institutions to participate in relevant regional and international meetings to facilitate the improved exchange of experiences and uptake of viable policy options;
- Concrete suggestions on how to raise awareness of policy-makers and donors' community on issues of SLM and CC in CA is seen through different forms of pro-active engagement with policy-makers (e.g. workshops, roundtable meetings, policy dialog meetings);
- Activity 3.1.1:
 - Develop an inventory of relevant institutions to get the farmers advisory services on technologies (e.g. departments of MoA, Soil Management, Land Management, Farmers Associations, NGOs, research organizations):
 - ⇒ *a specified list should be ready by the end of January 2014;*
 - To start the survey the team should develop a checklist (questionnaire) to survey the institutions => ICARDA to send a template by 01 Jan. 2014:
 - ⇒ *by end of February the team should finish the methodology and format of the checklist;*
 - ⇒ *finish the survey (incl. a group of farmers) by the end of June 2014;*
- Activity 3.1.2:
 - Include the case studies of good extension services:
 - Kazakhstan – World Bank System of the Competitive Grants operating for 3 years;
 - Kyrgyzstan – Rural Extension Service funded by WB and other donors operating for 15 years;
 - Uzbekistan – Farmers Association Departments consulting farmers on technologies;
 - ⇒ *all the case studies should be submitted by the end of August 2014;*
- Activity 3.1.3:
 - Component 1 to provide to Component 3 a list of the SLM practices to start the cost-benefit analysis. *Component 3 should get this information by the end of December 2013;*
 - Socio-economist and other group members to submit a detailed cost-benefit analysis (CBA) form for each SLM practice by end of January 2014. CBA form should include such indicators as yields, water saving, input saving, labor saving, machinery, net and gross income;
 - ⇒ *ICARDA to send the feedback by end of February 2014;*
 - ⇒ *Finish the data collection on CBA by the end of July 2014 for preparing a draft.*

In 2014 organize a training course for the project team in Central Asian country (can be combined with the ICARDA planning meeting tentatively to be held in May-June) (subject to the budget availability).

--

During plenary session, there were concerns raised by participants from the country partner organizations that if demo-plot establishment is necessary then it requires large investments. General consensus was that efforts will be made to engage ongoing demonstration or trials from other projects of ICARDA or partners in places.

Among other initiatives where climate change impact assessment related activities could benefit is GIS/Modeling training for NARS on downloading of outputs of Global Circulation Models for Climate Change scenarios planned in December 2013 by ICARDA-HQ.

There are strong linkages between project components and it should go without saying that activities need to be synchronized. Based on discussions during plenary session, there were several events defined by each component where trainings, workshops, field-days etc. were requested. The following table is an attempt to synchronise such events to conduct jointly, optimize dates or to distinguish by national or regional level. While events conducted at national level can be covered by relevant budget allotted for the country, regional events that require large amount of resources and are in line with ICARDA regional level activities are mapped below to plan to be covered by additional resources coming outside of the project budget.

	National	Regional	Tentative Date
Component 1		Regional review of SLM by 5 countries + similarity criteria	Feb 14
		Climate change downscaling	
	Field days per demo site per country		Yearly
Component 2	KZ 2 yearly train the trainers meetings		Yearly
	KZ 3 extension meetings		Yearly
	UZ training meetings		Mar/Apr 14
	TJ 3 train the trainers meetings (per agro-ecosystems)		Yearly
	KRG Training for trainers + farmers		14, 15,16
Component 3		Cost benefit analysis of SLM	
	Stakeholder meeting - each country		2015
Project level		Yearly meeting	2014-2016
		End of project stakeholder meeting	
		Share Fair	2014? 2016?

The project coordinator will ensure the synchronization of the regional activities to optimize resources and maximize the benefits for the project's partners.

Conclusions, closure, and actions to follow up

- Thank all participants on behalf of the project for their efforts, contributions, and active participation;
- Participants showed understanding of the noble objectives of the project and demonstrated active support for implementation, including efforts to locate opportunities for demonstration plots, identification of events where 'share-fair' can be embedded as part of those events;
- This KM in CACILM II project is tackling issues which are also on agenda of CGIAR Research Programs, particularly the Dryland Systems CRP (CRP 1.1);
- Actions to follow up stated during the inception workshop were achieved, namely:
 - project team in each country is formed (except Turkmenistan);

- suggestion for a steering committee members is put forward to IFAD for consideration (given the fact that CACILM Steering Committee is no longer functional);
- project coordinator is appointed;
- MoA to be printed and signed by ICARDA, then send to country focal points for signatures;
- The participants endorsed the text of the MoA, through which the country focal point receives a budget of USD 43,100 for implementation of activities in the first year;
- WOCAT technology and approach description format needs to be shortened and adapted for this project;
- The participants agreed to actively engage a wide range of stakeholders and partners of SLM in each country;
- Turkmenistan visit to engage them in the project, as well as country visits for backstopping activities (in all countries);
- Information about SLM from all countries will be received by the project coordinator in a progressive manner and will be finalized on December 31st;
- Communication among the partners of this project should be fostered to encourage free flow of knowledge and progress. Any delay should be reported to solve the issues that retard implementation;
- A systematic follow up (monitoring and evaluation) plan will be suggested by the project coordinator;
- Prepare and distribute a simplified version of WOCAT questionnaires to facilitate documentation of SLM. Also use the existing documented SLM in WOCAT for Central Asia as well as from other similar areas (www.wocat.net);
- Foster and maintain synergy and collaboration among countries as well as among the three component to optimize resources and allow free knowledge exchange.